



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 54

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Third Legislature

Wednesday, August 14, 1996

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Introduction of New Member

The Deputy Speaker announced that he had received from the Chief Electoral Officer of Alberta the report of the Returning Officer for the constituency of Redwater containing the results of the by-election conducted May 21, 1996 in the constituency and the said report further shows that Mary Anne Balsillie was duly elected as the Member for Redwater.

Mrs. Balsillie joined Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Bruseker, Hon. Official Opposition House Leader, at the Bar and was then escorted to the Mace. Mr. Mitchell presented Mrs. Balsillie to the Deputy Speaker, and the Hon. Member for Redwater took her seat in the Assembly.

Also, Mr. Speaker introduced to Hon. Members, Ms Shannon Dean, the new Parliamentary Counsel.

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, presented a petition from 1,938 Calgarians regarding the Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational. Mr. Dunford, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-West, presented a petition from 3,886 Lethbridge residents regarding the Gaming and Liquor Control Act allowing the transportation of open liquor bottles in vehicles.

Mr. Bruseker, Hon. Member for Calgary-North West, presented a petition from 2,448 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 1,905 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 1,870 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 1,869 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mr. Dalla-Longa, Hon. Member for Calgary-West, presented a petition from 1,513 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mr. Van Binsbergen, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead, presented a petition from 704 Calgarians regarding hospital closures in Calgary and an independent public inquiry on health facilities.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 1,249 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mr. Bracko, Hon. Member for St. Albert, presented a petition from 247 Albertans regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mrs. Balsillie, Hon. Member for Redwater, presented a petition from 1,700 Calgarians regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Mr. Zwozdesky, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Avonmore, presented a petition from 189 Calgarians regarding hospital closures in Calgary and an independent public inquiry on health facilities.

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 1,700 Calgarians and Albertans regarding Calgary General Hospital remaining open and operational.

Notices of Motions

Mr. Magnus, Hon. Member for Calgary-North Hill, gave oral notice of his intention to introduce the following Bill tomorrow, Thursday, August 15, 1996:

Bill 49 Gas Utilities Amendment Act, 1996 — Mr. Magnus

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, gave oral notice of his intention to move, pursuant to Standing Order 30, that the Assembly adjourn to discuss a matter of urgent public importance, namely, the need for an interim budget to adequately fund health care in Alberta given that the Minister of Health has admitted that the government has cut too much funding from the current health care budget which has resulted in unnecessary suffering and death.

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Member for Edmonton-McClung, gave oral notice of his intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 40:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly of Alberta urge the government to create a special non-partisan review board to investigate the damage done by budget cuts and government policy to the health care system and make recommendations for remedial action.

Introduction of Bills (First Reading)

Notice having been given:

Bill 46 Electoral Divisions Act — Hon. Mr. Evans

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Dr. West, Minister of Economic Development and Tourism:

Order in Council No. 1158/96 - Gaming and Liquor Amendment Regulation
Sessional Paper 1158/96

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Letter, dated July 4, 1996 from Calgary Mayor Al Duerr to the Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and Mr. Bud McCaig, calling for an independent study of health services in Calgary

Sessional Paper 1159/96

Dr. L. Taylor, Hon. Member for Cypress-Medicine Hat:

Alberta Research Council, Annual Report, 1995-96.

Sessional Paper 37/96

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Letters from various writers and associations, variously dated and signed, to the Hon. Member regarding concerns about the closure of the Calgary General Hospital

Sessional Paper 1160/96

Coupons from 318 Calgarians calling for an immediate moratorium on all capital cost expenditures and hospital closures until there have been full public hearings

Sessional Paper 1161/96

Mr. Havelock, Hon. Member for Calgary-Shaw:

Share Sale Agreement dated July 12, 1996, between Her Majesty the Queen in Right of the Province of Alberta and Alberta Special Waste Management Corporation and Bovar Technology Ltd. and Bovar Inc. and Bovar (Swan Hills) Limited Partnership and 542936 Alberta Ltd. and Chem-Security (Alberta) Ltd.

Sessional Paper 1162/96

Mr. Bruseker, Hon. Member for Calgary-North West:

Letter, dated April 2, 1996, from Alderman Bob Hawkesworth to Paul Rushforth, Chief Executive Officer, requesting information on the rationale for closure of Calgary General Hospital and Holy Cross hospital

Sessional Paper 1163/96

Letter, dated May 8, 1996, from Alderman John Schmal to Paul Rushforth, Chief Executive Officer, requesting a breakdown of the Calgary Regional Health Authority's costs to renovate the Calgary General Hospital rather than close it

Sessional Paper 1164/96

Document, dated May 16, 1996, written by Calgary City Aldermen Mr. Bob Hawkesworth, Joe Chichi, and John Schmal, entitled "The Calgary General Hospital: A Time for a Considered Second Thought"

Sessional Paper 1165/96

Letter, dated June 5, 1996, from Alderman John Schmal to Bud McCaig, Chairman, Calgary Regional Health Authority, concerning the definition of the Calgary Regional Health Authority for the term "immediate care"

Sessional Paper 1166/96

Letter, dated June 6, 1996, from Alderman John Schmal to Bud McCaig, Chairman, Calgary Regional Health Authority, requesting why the freeze on hospital construction was removed that allowed \$100 million of construction to occur in three Calgary hospitals

Sessional Paper 1167/96

Mr. Decore, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Letter, dated July 22, 1996, from Pearl Zacharko to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health, regarding the deterioration of health services

Sessional Paper 1168/96

Mr. Dalla-Longa, Hon. Member for Calgary-West:

Submission, dated May 7 and 8, 1996, from The Alumnae Association of the Calgary General Hospital regarding a moratorium be placed on the proposed closure of the Calgary General Hospital

Sessional Paper 1169/96

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Guest column from Dr. Thomas Rich regarding Calgary acute care hospitals and inner city needs

Sessional Paper 1170/96

Letter to the editor of the Calgary Herald from Howard McEwen regarding Calgary acute care hospitals

Sessional Paper 1171/96

Statement, undated, from M. Eileen Teslenka to regarding the deterioration of health care services

Sessional Paper 1172/96

Mrs. Hewes, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter, from Phyllis McNally on behalf of the Calgary Kerby Senior Centre, requesting that the Calgary General Hospital be kept open

Sessional Paper 1173/96

Statement dated September 1995, entitled "Changes in the Alberta Health Care System, by Sabine Joffe, of Calgary, regarding an analysis of the problems in health care

Sessional Paper 1174/96

Mr. Zwozdesky, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Avonmore:

Document, dated May/June, 1996, entitled "Downtown Hospital, Calgary General Hospital, Savings: 1994" regarding ambulance, access, emergency, cost effectiveness and purpose of the Calgary General Hospital

Sessional Paper 1175/96

Article dated May 1995, by Dr. Dennis Linden, entitled "A Critical Appraisal of the CRHA Budget..." regarding cost comparisons and budgeting within the Calgary Regional Health Authority

Sessional Paper 1176/96

Edmonton Journal article by Ed Struzik entitled, "Rural MDs see more strain, less income"

Sessional Paper 1177/96

Calgary Herald article dated May 12, 1996, by Wendy Dudley regarding shortages of doctors in rural areas

Sessional Paper 1178/96

Dr. Percy, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Whitemud:

Open letter, dated May 26, 1996, from Dr. Thomas Rich regarding acute care hospitals and inner city needs

Sessional Paper 1179/96

Mr. Kirkland, Hon. Member for Leduc:

Letter, dated May 12, 1996, from Alderman John Schmal to Bud McCaig, Chairman, Calgary Regional Health Authority, regarding capital expenditures proposed by the Calgary Regional Health Authority

Sessional Paper 1180/96

Letter, dated May 15, 1996, from Ann Kurpe to Bob Nicholson, CBC Television, regarding lack of public input and capital expenditures proposed by the Calgary Regional Health Authority

Sessional Paper 1181/96

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Submission prepared by Gordon M. Christie, May 7, 1996, to the Hearings on Proposed Closure of the Calgary General Hospital, Calgary District Labour Council

Sessional Paper 1182/96

Letter, dated March 8, 1996, from Anita Mitzner, President of Local 115 of the United Nurses of Alberta to John R. McCaig, Chairman, Calgary Regional Health Authority, regarding participation by bedside nurses with regards to restructuring of the health care system in Calgary

Sessional Paper 1183/96

Article, dated February, 1995, from Region 4 Health Services Information Publication, entitled "CRHA (Calgary Regional Health Authority) representatives meet with union groups to discuss impacts of health reform"

Sessional Paper 1184/96

Two fact sheets prepared by the "Keep the General Committee" regarding why Calgary General Hospital should remain open

Sessional Paper 1185/96

Mr. Sekulic, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning:

Letter dated May 26, 1996, from Dr. Thomas Rich regarding acute care hospitals and inner city needs

Sessional Paper 1186/96

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

Article by concerned citizens of Calgary and the Medical Staff Association of Calgary General Hospital, regarding facts about cost effectiveness of keeping the Calgary General Hospital open

Sessional Paper 1187/96

Mr. Henry, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Edmonton Journal article, dated August 13, 1996, by Staff writer, Ed Struzik, regarding concerns of the Professional Advisory Committee at the University of Alberta Hospital

Sessional Paper 1188/96

Letter, dated February 20, 1996, from (name deleted to protect privacy) to Mr. Henry, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, regarding treatment at an Edmonton Hospital

Sessional Paper 1189/96

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Statement, dated August 8, 1996, of Mrs. Woloshyniuk, and statement on behalf of her five-year-old daughter, Christy, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system

Sessional Paper 1190/96

Statement, dated July 25, 1996, of Bert and Ingeborg Wagner regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system and, letter of response dated August 8, 1996, from Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, to Mr. Brian Lemon, Chair, Capital Health Authority

Sessional Paper 1191/96

Statement, dated April 23, 1996, of Mrs. Charolette Campbell regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system, and letter of response dated April 29, 1996, from Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, to Mr. Brian Lemon, Chair, Capital Health Authority, and letter dated May 15, 1996, from Sheila Weatherill, Vice-President, Community Care and Public Health to Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition

Sessional Paper 1192/96

Statement, dated April 17, 1996, of Ms. Tamblyn and her father regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system, and letter of response dated April 17, 1996, from Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, to Mr. Brian Lemon, Chair, Capital Health Authority, and letter dated May 28, 1996, from Dennis W. Jirsch, Vice-President and Chief Clinical Officer

Sessional Paper 1193/96

Statement, dated February 23, 1996, of an individual and his wife regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system

Sessional Paper 1194/96

Statement, dated August 14, 1996, of a 75-year-old constituent regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system

Sessional Paper 1195/96

Mr. Bracko, Hon. Member for St. Albert:

Article, dated July 31, 1996, from St. Albert & Sturgeon Gazette, regarding the state of health care

Sessional Paper 1196/96

Article, dated August 3, 1996, from St. Albert & Sturgeon Gazette, entitled "Angry MDs to Study Region's Health Crisis", regarding the state of health care

Sessional Paper 1197/96

Editorial, dated August 7, 1996, from St. Albert & Sturgeon Gazette, entitled "Gagging our doctors won't solve anything"

Sessional Paper 1198/96

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Statement about Gian Barrich

Sessional Paper 1199/96

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Canadian Press article, dated August 3, 1996, entitled "Doctors to start 'leak of the week'"

Sessional Paper 1200/96

Ms Hanson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Beverly:

Edmonton Journal article, dated August 13, 1996, by Rick Pedersen, entitled "'Things fell through the cracks,' doctor says"

Sessional Paper 1201/96

Mr. Kirkland, Hon. Member for Leduc:

Letter, dated June 9, 1996, from medical professionals at Leduc hospital to the Hon. Minister of Health requesting intervention of the Minister of Health

Sessional Paper 1202/96

Letter, dated May 24, 1996, from Leduc Mayor, John Jackie, to Crossroads Regional Health Authority, expressing alarm at staff reduction at Leduc hospital
Sessional Paper 1203/96

Letter, undated, from Faye Brown to Mr. Kirkland, Hon. Member for Leduc, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1204/96

Mrs. Hewes, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Chronology of Mr. Harry Baggot's wife, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1205/96

Chronology of Mr. John Bouchard regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1206/96

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

Letter, dated June 4, 1995, from Mr. Bruce Eddy to Minister of Health regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1207/96

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter, dated August 7, 1996, from Dennis W. Jirsch to Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, regarding a constituent's difficulties with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1208/96

Chronology, dated July 16, 1996, concerning Jack DeBolt, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1209/96

Letter, dated July 31, 1996, from Terry Wagner to Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system by her husband
Sessional Paper 1210/96

Ms Hanson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Beverly:

Edmonton Journal article, by Rick Pedersen, dated August 14, 1996, entitled "Family forced to leave mom at hospital"
Sessional Paper 1211/96

Mr. Collingwood, Hon. Member for Sherwood Park:

Letter, dated July 17, 1996, published in the Edmonton Journal, from Michael and Kelley Thompson, regarding difficulties with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1212/96

Letter, dated July 10, 1996, from Cam Eddy to Mr. Collingwood, Hon. Member for Sherwood Park, regarding difficulties with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1213/96

Letter, dated August 7, 1996, from Bonnie Cessford to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding difficulties with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1214/96

Mr. Vasseur, Hon. Member for Bonnyville:

Edmonton Journal article, dated July 29, 1996, by Ed Struzik and James Stevenson entitled, "Crisis seen as rural MDs quit"
Sessional Paper 1215/96

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mayfield:

Edmonton Journal article, dated June 16, 1996, by David Howell entitled, "Frustrated psychiatrist set to quit"
Sessional Paper 1216/96

Mr. Dalla-Longa, Hon. Member for Calgary-West:

Calgary Sun article, dated August 2, 1996, by Steve Chase entitled, "Docs plan to covet PR fight"
Sessional Paper 1217/96

Mrs. Balsillie, Hon. Member for Redwater:

Letter, undated, from an elderly constituent describing difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1218/96

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter, dated April 25, 1996, from Mr. Ulmer to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding state of health care
Sessional Paper 1219/96

Letter, dated May 1, 1996, from Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, on behalf of Mr. and Mrs. Lindi, to the Minister of Health, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1220/96

Letter, dated May 21, 1996, from Eveline M. Huff to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system
Sessional Paper 1221/96

Mr. Chadi, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Roper:

Edmonton Sun article dated August 12, 1996 by Michelle Nicholson entitled, "Departing doc fears for patients"
Sessional Paper 1222/96

Mr. Sekulic, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning:

Edmonton Journal article, dated August 2, 1996, by Tom Arnold and David Howell entitled "Health crisis answers urged"

Sessional Paper 1223/96

Mr. Tannas, Hon. Deputy Speaker, pursuant to the Electoral Boundaries Commission Act, cE-4.01:

Proposed Electoral Division Areas, Boundaries and Names for Alberta, Final Report to the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly of Alberta, 1995-96 Alberta Electoral Boundaries Commission, June, 1996

Sessional Paper 1224/96

Mr. Tannas, Hon. Deputy Speaker, pursuant to the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act, cF-18.5 s61:

Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner, Annual Report, 1995-96

Sessional Paper 6/96

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods:

Fax, undated, from Bev Exelby, to Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, regarding difficulties experienced with the health care system

Sessional Paper 1225/96

Ministerial Statements

Hon. Mr. Dinning, Provincial Treasurer, on behalf of the Hon. Premier, made a statement acknowledging the success of Alberta-based athletes who were part of Canada's team at the Centennial Olympics (1996) in Atlanta, Georgia.

Mr. Zwozdesky, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Avonmore, commented on the statement.

Motion for Adjournment for an Emergency Debate

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, requested leave to move, pursuant to Standing Order 30, that the Assembly adjourn to discuss a matter of urgent public importance, namely, the need for an interim budget to adequately fund health care in Alberta given that the Minister of Health has admitted that the government has cut too much funding from the current health care budget which has resulted in unnecessary suffering and death.

A debate followed on urgency.

The Speaker ruled that the request for leave was not in order.

Motions Under Standing Order 40

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly of Alberta urge the government to create a special non-partisan review board to investigate the damage done by budget cuts and government policy to the health care system and make recommendations for remedial action.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, moved adjournment of the Assembly, which was not agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 24

Balsillie	Hanson	Sapers
Bracko	Henry	Sekulic
Bruseker	Hewes	Soetaert
Carlson	Kirkland	Van Binsbergen
Chadi	Leibovici	Vasseur
Collingwood	Massey	White
Dalla-Longa	Mitchell	Wickman
Dickson	Percy	Zwozdesky

Against the motion: 48

Ady	Forsyth	Mirosh
Amery	Fritz	Oberg
Beniuk	Gordon	Paszkowski
Black	Haley	Pham
Brassard	Havelock	Renner
Burgener	Herard	Rostad
Calahasen	Hierath	Severtson
Cardinal	Hlady	Shariff
Clegg	Jacques	Smith
Coutts	Jonson	Stelmach
Day	Kowalski	Taylor
Dinning	Laing	Thurber
Doerksen	Lund	Trynchy
Dunford	Magnus	West
Evans	McClellan	Woloshyn
Fischer	McFarland	Yankowsky

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

Q206, Q207, Q208, Q211.

Motions for Returns

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

M199, M200, M203, M204, M205, M209, M210, M212, M213, M214.

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 216 Crown Contracts Dispute Resolution Act — Mr. Jacques

A debate followed.

Mr. Collingwood moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Evans, Deputy Government House Leader, that it be called 5:30 p.m., the Assembly adjourned at 5:27 p.m. until 8:00 p.m.

WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 14, 1996 — 8:00 P.M.

Government Motions

Hon. Mr. Day, Government House Leader, requested and received unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 38(1) to move the following motion:

22. Be it resolved that Standing Order 49(2)(f) be amended by striking out "15" and substituting "9" and that this amendment take effect on the date that the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund Act (SA 1996, cA-27.01) is proclaimed into force.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

Hon. Mr. Day, Government House Leader, requested and received unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 38(1) to move the following motion:

23. Be it resolved that the following changes to the following Committees be approved by the Assembly:

on the Special Standing Committee on Member Services, that Mr. Stelmach replace Mr. Woloshyn as Deputy Chairman and that Mr. Severtson replace Mr. Stelmach;

on the Select Standing Committee on Privileges and Elections, that Mr. Stelmach replace Mr. Woloshyn; and

on the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts, that Mr. Havelock replace Ms Calahasen and that Mr. Renner replace Mr. McFarland.

Be it further resolved that on the date the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund Act (SA 1996, cA-27.01) is proclaimed into force, the present members of the Select Standing Committee on the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund Act be replaced with the following 9 (nine) members:

Mr. Dunford, Chairman
Mr. Doerksen, Deputy Chairman
Ms Carlson
Mrs. Forsyth
Mr. Havelock
Mr. Langevin
Dr. Percy
Mr. Sekulic
Mr. Shariff

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

Hon. Mr. Evans, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 73(1) allowing for Second Reading consideration of Bill 46, Electoral Divisions Act.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 41 Water Act — Hon. Mr. Lund

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Evans, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 9:52 p.m. until Thursday, August 15, 1996, at 1:30 p.m.

Title: Wednesday, August 14, 1996